

# SUNSET AUDIT REPORT

2022-S3

---

Arts Advisory Commission

Mayor's Office

August 12, 2022

---

MUNICIPALITY OF ANCHORAGE  
Office of Internal Audit  
632 W 6th Avenue, Suite 710  
P.O. Box 196650  
Anchorage, Alaska 99519-6650  
[www.muni.org/departments/internal\\_audit](http://www.muni.org/departments/internal_audit)



OFFICE OF INTERNAL AUDIT  
Michael Chadwick, CIA, CICA  
Director  
Phone: (907) 343-4438

E-Mail: [michael.chadwick@anchorageak.gov](mailto:michael.chadwick@anchorageak.gov)



**MUNICIPALITY OF ANCHORAGE**  
**MAYOR DAVE BRONSON**

---

**OFFICE OF INTERNAL AUDIT**

August 12, 2022

Honorable Mayor and Members of the Assembly:

I am pleased to present for your review **Sunset Audit Report 2022-S3, Arts Advisory Commission, Mayor's Office**. A summary of the report is presented below.

In accordance with Assembly Ordinance Number 2011-64(S-1), Section 14, we have performed a sunset audit of the Arts Advisory Commission. The objective of this audit was to provide information to the Mayor and Assembly to assist them in determining if the Arts Advisory Commission should be reauthorized. Our audit included a review of documents pertaining to matters such as meeting minutes, meeting agendas, topics discussed at Arts Advisory Commission meetings, member authorization, and member participation.

Based on our review of documents pertaining to matters such as meeting minutes, meeting agendas, topics discussed at Arts Advisory Commission meetings, member authorization, and member participation, we recommend that the Arts Advisory Commission be reauthorized. However, the Arts Advisory Commission did not always announce upcoming meetings, could not readily locate meeting minutes, and could not provide complete attendance records and meeting agendas.

The Arts Advisory Commission will sunset October 14, 2022, unless reauthorized by the Assembly.

Michael Chadwick, CIA, CICA  
Director, Internal Audit



MUNICIPALITY OF ANCHORAGE  
MAYOR DAVE BRONSON

---

OFFICE OF INTERNAL AUDIT

August 12, 2022

**Sunset Audit Report 2022-S3**  
**Arts Advisory Commission**  
**Mayor's Office**

**Introduction.** We have performed a sunset audit of the Arts Advisory Commission (Commission) as required by Assembly Ordinance Number 2011-64(S-1), Section 14 which states:

*“The Municipal Clerk shall notify the Assembly and the Mayor by assembly memorandum at least 120 days prior to the sunset of any board or commission, and an ordinance for reauthorization shall be introduced through the Assembly Chair with the assembly memorandum. The assembly memorandum shall include direction to the Office of Internal Audit to audit the board or commission under Anchorage Municipal Code section 3.20.110 D.3. and 4. The Office of Internal Audit shall report its findings to the Mayor and Assembly at least 60 days, prior to sunset, prior to vote by the Assembly on reauthorization.”*

**Objective and Scope.** The objective of this audit was to provide information to the Mayor and Assembly to assist them in determining if the Commission should be reauthorized. Our audit included a review of documents pertaining to matters such as meeting minutes, meeting agendas, topics discussed at Commission meetings, member authorization, and member participation.

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards, except for the requirement of an external quality control review. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

**Overall Evaluation.** Based on our review of documents pertaining to matters such as meeting minutes, meeting agendas, topics discussed at Commission meetings, member authorization, and member participation, we recommend that the Commission be reauthorized. However, the Commission did not always announce upcoming meetings, could not readily locate meeting minutes, and could not provide complete attendance records and meeting agendas.

## SUNSET FACTORS

The following factors were used in our evaluation and are presented for information to the Mayor and Assembly:

1. **Name of Commission.**

Arts Advisory Commission

2. **Sunset Date.**

October 14, 2022

3. **The purpose and goal of the Commission.**

*Anchorage Municipal Code (AMC) subsection 4.60.150A., Arts advisory commission, states  
"The commission shall:*

- 1. Advise the mayor and assembly concerning all matters pertaining to municipal involvement in the arts in the community except those programs officially under the purview of other advisory bodies.*
- 2. Receive requests for funds from community arts organizations and recommend to the mayor and assembly those projects and organizations which should receive municipal funding.*
- 3. Promote public and private cooperation in support of the arts."*

4. **Is the Commission fully staffed?**

*AMC subsection 4.60.150A. states "There is established an arts advisory commission consisting of nine members."*

**Audit Finding.** Currently, the Commission is staffed with seven of the required nine members.

<b><u>Commission Member</u></b>	<b><u>Most Recent Assembly Confirmation</u></b>	<b><u>Term Expiration Date</u></b>
Brooks Adam Banker	3-10-20	10-14-22
Jade Aldridge	9-15-20	10-14-22
Jovell Rennie	6-22-21	10-14-23
Amie Haakenson	12-7-21	10-14-24
Lauren Hughes	12-7-21	10-14-24
V Rae	12-7-21	10-14-23
Kimberly Ovsepyan	2-15-22	10-14-23
Vacant		
Vacant		

Source: Assembly Memorandums

5. **Are the terms of the Commission members current?**

*AMC section 4.05.040, Terms, states "Except as otherwise specified in this Code, the regular term of each member of a board or commission is three years commencing on October 15 of the year in which appointed and ending three years thereafter on October 14, provided however, to avoid a vacancy until new appointments can be made and confirmed, an appointed member's term is extended until a new appointment is confirmed or a maximum of 120 days which ever occurs first. The terms of initial or subsequent appointments to a board or commission shall be*

*staggered so that, as nearly as possible, a pro rata number of its members shall be appointed each year of the established regular term of office.”*

**Audit Finding.** The terms for all Commission members are current.

6. **Were positions deemed vacant after the maximum number of absences?**

*AMC subsection 4.05.060A., Attendance requirements; vacancies, states “The office of a member of a board or commission member shall become vacant if the member:*

1. *Ceases to meet the qualifications prescribed for the office;*
2. *Resigns;*
3. *Dies;*
4. *Is judicially determined to be incompetent;*
5. *Is convicted of a felony;*
6. *Is removed from office for breach of the public trust; or*
7. *During any 12-month period while in office:*
  - a. *Is absent from three regular meetings without excuse;*
  - b. *Is absent from:*
    - i. *Six regular meetings; or*
    - ii. *Eight regular meetings for members of the planning and zoning commission, urban design commission, platting board, or zoning board of examiners and appeals; or*
  - c. *Fails to attend a two-thirds majority of the regular meetings without excuse.”*

**Audit Finding.** Since the Commission could only provide meeting minutes for 8 of the 11 meetings, we could not accurately determine if these requirements were met.

7. **Did the Commission meet regularly?**

*AMC section 4.05.090, Meetings, states “A board or commission shall hold regular monthly meetings at such time and place as may from time to time be designated by the board or*

*commission, but meetings need not be held if no business is pending. Boards and commissions shall advise the public of their meeting schedules, or publicly advertise their meetings where necessitated by statutory requirements. The chairman of a board or commission, or the municipal employee who is designated as an ex officio member of the board or commission pursuant to section 4.05.140, or a majority of the board or commission, may call a special meeting of the board or commission. Meetings of all boards and commissions shall be open to the public, except for an executive session, from which the public may be excluded.”*

**Audit Finding.** From January 2021 through June 2022, the Commission met 11 times. According to Commission staff, for three of these meetings, “. . . the meetings could not officially continue since quorum was not met.” Meetings were not always publicly announced on the Municipality of Anchorage’s Public Notices website and on the Mayor’s website. Although meetings are announced on the Commission’s website, the meeting announcement stating that “During the summer, the Arts Commission Meets [sic] the 2<sup>nd</sup> Monday of the month, 6:00 p.m. in the Mayor’s Conference Room (City Hall, 632 W. 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Room 830)” did not apply. Specifically, in 2021 the summer meetings that occurred in July and August were held on Tuesdays.

**8. Were minutes taken and published?**

*AMC section 4.05.130, Reports, minutes and public hearing records, states “A board or commission shall keep minutes of the board or commission proceedings, and such minutes shall record the vote of each member physically present upon every question formally presented to the board or commissions for its consideration. The minutes shall be maintained in the custody of the municipal agency which supplies staff support to the board or commission and shall be a public record, open to inspection by any person.”*

**Audit Finding.** Meeting minutes were not taken for 3 of the 11 Commission meetings. Meeting minutes are not readily available for the public.

9. **Did meetings have action items or other business?**

*AMC subsection 4.60.150A. states "The commission shall:*

- 1. Advise the mayor and assembly concerning all matters pertaining to municipal involvement in the arts in the community except those programs officially under the purview of other advisory bodies.*
- 2. Receive requests for funds from community arts organizations and recommend to the mayor and assembly those projects and organizations which should receive municipal funding.*
- 3. Promote public and private cooperation in support of the arts."*

**Audit Finding.** From January 2021 through June 2022, the Commission did not issue any resolutions or reports. However, the March 2021 meeting minutes contained a list of final scores and recommendations for art grants and that the chair would email the Mayor a formal letter with their recommendations. Meeting minutes also contained notes on topics such as community outreach and timelines with scoring methodology for the art grants.