

SUNSET AUDIT REPORT

2021-S10

Youth Advisory Commission

Office of the Mayor

August 13, 2021

MUNICIPALITY OF ANCHORAGE
Internal Audit Department
632 W 6th Avenue, Suite 710
P.O. Box 196650
Anchorage, Alaska 99519-6650
www.muni.org/departments/internal_audit



INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT
Michael Chadwick, CIA, CICA
Director
Phone: (907) 343-4438

E-Mail: michael.chadwick@anchorageak.gov



MUNICIPALITY OF ANCHORAGE
MAYOR DAVE BRONSON

INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT

August 13, 2021

Honorable Mayor and Members of the Assembly:

I am pleased to present for your review **Sunset Audit Report 2021-S10, Youth Advisory Commission, Office of the Mayor**. A brief summary of the report is presented below.

In accordance with Assembly Ordinance Number 2011-64(S-1), Section 14, we have performed a sunset audit of the Youth Advisory Commission. The objective of this audit was to provide information to the Mayor and Assembly to assist them in determining if the Youth Advisory Commission should be reauthorized. Our audit included a review of meeting minutes, resolutions and agendas, and member authorization and participation.

Based on our review of meeting minutes, resolutions, and attendance records, we recommend that the Youth Advisory Commission be allowed to sunset and not be reauthorized. From January 2020 through May 2021, the Youth Advisory Commission did not meet. Although we were provided an agenda for a February 27, 2020, meeting, we never received the meeting minutes and could not find a meeting announcement. Therefore, we could not confirm that the meeting occurred. In addition, from January 2020 through May 2021, the Youth Advisory Commission did not provide any reports or resolutions to the Mayor's Office or the Assembly and had not nominated a youth representative and an alternate youth representative to the Assembly. Furthermore, in June 2021 we found that the Youth Advisory Commission was staffed with 5 of the required 15 members. We recognize that the COVID-19 pandemic impacted the Youth Advisory Commission; however, other boards and commissions we reviewed continued operating despite the COVID-19 pandemic. Below is a brief history of prior actions taken with the Youth Advisory Commission.

Commission History
2012 – 2018

<u>Date</u>	<u>Action</u>
8-15-12	Sunset Audit Report 2012-S5 recommended “. . . that the Youth Advisory Commission be allowed to sunset and not be reauthorized.” In that report we noted that the Youth Advisory Commission was staffed with three of the required nine members, had not met from January 2011 through July 2012 because a quorum could not be established, and had not provided any reports or resolutions to the Mayor's Office or the Assembly from January 2011 through July 2012.

Commission History 2012 – 2018

<u>Date</u>	<u>Action</u>
10-9-12	The Assembly approved Assembly Ordinance 2012-60(S) which terminated the Youth Advisory Commission.
11-10-15	The Assembly approved Assembly Ordinance 2015-119 “. . . to affirmatively continue and reenact the Youth Advisory Commission” with a sunset date of October 14, 2018, “. . . unless affirmatively continued by the Assembly in accordance with section 4.05.150.”
8-14-18	Sunset Audit Report 2018-S10 recommended that “. . . the Commission be reauthorized for one year, with another sunset audit at that time. Although the Commission appeared active, it did not regularly record meeting minutes with associated attendance. For meeting minutes that were provided to us, in most instances they did not include attendance records or indicate if minutes were approved. In addition, in mid-July 2018, we reviewed Commission members and found that the Commission was staffed with 5 of the required 15 members, with the term of one member having expired on October 14, 2016. On July 31, 2018, the Anchorage Assembly approved nine individuals to serve on the Commission and reappointed the individual whose term had expired.”
10-9-18	The Assembly approved Assembly Ordinance 2018-47 to continue the Youth Advisory Commission until October 14, 2021, pending further continuation by the Assembly in accordance with Anchorage Municipal Code section 4.05.150.

The Youth Advisory Commission will sunset October 14, 2021, unless reauthorized by the Assembly.



Michael Chadwick, CIA, CICA
Director, Internal Audit



MUNICIPALITY OF ANCHORAGE
MAYOR DAVE BRONSON

INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT

August 13, 2021

Sunset Audit Report 2021-S10
Youth Advisory Commission
Office of the Mayor

Introduction. We have performed a sunset audit of the Youth Advisory Commission (Commission) as required by Assembly Ordinance (AO) Number 2011-64(S-1), Section 14 which states:

“The Municipal Clerk shall notify the Assembly and the Mayor by assembly memorandum at least 120 days prior to the sunset of any board or commission, and an ordinance for reauthorization shall be introduced through the Assembly Chair with the assembly memorandum. The assembly memorandum shall include direction to the Office of Internal Audit to audit the board or commission under Anchorage Municipal Code section 3.20.110 D.3. and 4. The Office of Internal Audit shall report its findings to the Mayor and Assembly at least 60 days, prior to sunset, prior to vote by the Assembly on reauthorization.”

Objective and Scope. The objective of this audit was to provide information to the Mayor and Assembly to assist them in determining if the Commission should be reauthorized. Our audit included a review of meeting minutes, resolutions and agendas, and member authorization and participation.

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards, except for the requirement of an external quality control review. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. The audit was performed during the period of May through June 2021.

Overall Evaluation. Based on our review of meeting minutes, resolutions, and attendance records, we recommend that the Commission be allowed to sunset and not be reauthorized. From January 2020 through May 2021, the Commission did not meet. Although we were provided an agenda for a February 27, 2020, meeting, we never received the meeting minutes and could not find a meeting announcement. Therefore, we could not confirm that the meeting occurred. In addition, from January 2020 through May 2021, the Commission did not provide any reports or resolutions to the Mayor's Office or the Assembly and had not nominated a youth representative and an alternate youth representative to the Assembly. Furthermore, in June 2021 we found that the Commission was staffed with 5 of the required 15 members. We recognize that the COVID-19 pandemic impacted the Commission; however, other boards and commissions we reviewed continued operating despite the COVID-19 pandemic. Below is a brief history of prior actions taken with the Commission.

Commission History 2012 – 2018

<u>Date</u>	<u>Action</u>
8-15-12	Sunset Audit Report 2012-S5 recommended “. . . that the Youth Advisory Commission be allowed to sunset and not be reauthorized.” In that report we noted that the Commission was staffed with three of the required nine members, had not met from January 2011 through July 2012 because a quorum could not be established, and had not provided any reports or resolutions to the Mayor's Office or the Assembly from January 2011 through July 2012.
10-9-12	The Assembly approved AO 2012-60(S) which terminated the Commission.
11-10-15	The Assembly approved AO 2015-119 “. . . to affirmatively continue and reenact the Youth Advisory Commission” with a sunset date of October 14, 2018, “. . . unless affirmatively continued by the Assembly in accordance with section 4.05.150.”

Commission History 2012 – 2018

<u>Date</u>	<u>Action</u>
8-14-18	Sunset Audit Report 2018-S10 recommended that “. . . the Commission be reauthorized for one year, with another sunset audit at that time. Although the Commission appeared active, it did not regularly record meeting minutes with associated attendance. For meeting minutes that were provided to us, in most instances they did not include attendance records or indicate if minutes were approved. In addition, in mid-July 2018, we reviewed Commission members and found that the Commission was staffed with 5 of the required 15 members, with the term of one member having expired on October 14, 2016. On July 31, 2018, the Anchorage Assembly approved nine individuals to serve on the Commission and reappointed the individual whose term had expired.”
10-9-18	The Assembly approved AO 2018-47 to continue the Commission until October 14, 2021, pending further continuation by the Assembly in accordance with Anchorage Municipal Code (AMC) section 4.05.150.

SUNSET FACTORS

The following factors were used in our evaluation and are presented for information to the Mayor and Assembly:

1. **Name of Commission.**

Youth Advisory Commission

2. **Sunset Date.**

October 14, 2021

3. **The purpose and goal of the Commission.**

AMC subsection 4.60.275A., Youth advisory commission; youth representative to the assembly, states "This commission will advise the mayor and assembly on issues, services and programs. The special assistant on youth development, or a designee selected by the mayor shall act as executive secretary for the commission. Members will be appointed by the mayor, subject to approval by the assembly."

4. **Is the Commission fully staffed?**

AMC subsection 4.60.275A. states "There is established a youth advisory commission consisting of 15 members between 14 and 22 years of age whose terms shall commence October 14, except as to members appointed to fill an unexpired term."

Audit Finding. Currently, the Commission is staffed with 5 of the required 15 members. Because the Commission did not meet from January 2020 through May 2021, we were unable to determine if other Commission members, whose terms expired, continued to serve on the Commission. Although we were provided an agenda for a February 27, 2020, meeting, we never received the meeting minutes and could not find a meeting announcement. Therefore, we could not confirm that the meeting occurred.

<u>Commission Member</u>	<u>Most Recent Assembly Confirmation</u>	<u>Term Expiration Date</u>
Natalie Fraser	7-31-18	10-14-21
Rainier Herczeg	7-31-18	10-14-21
Alejja Stover	7-31-18	10-14-21
Scott Santaella	10-23-18	10-14-21
Eriana Smith-Vanilau	10-23-18	10-14-21
Vacant		
Vacant		
Vacant		
Vacant		
Vacant		
Vacant		
Vacant		
Vacant		
Vacant		
Vacant		

Source: Assembly Memorandums

5. Are the terms of the Commission members current?

AMC section 4.05.040, Terms, states “Except as otherwise specified in this Code, the regular term of each member of a board or commission is three years commencing on October 15 of the year in which appointed and ending three years thereafter on October 14, provided however, to avoid a vacancy until new appointments can be made and confirmed, an appointed member's term is extended until a new appointment is confirmed or a maximum of 120 days which ever occurs first. The terms of initial or subsequent appointments to a board or commission shall be

staggered so that, as nearly as possible, a pro rata number of its members shall be appointed each year of the established regular term of office."

Audit Finding. The terms for five Commission members are current.

6. **Were positions deemed vacant after the maximum number of absences?**

AMC subsection 4.05.060A., Attendance requirements; vacancies, states "The office of a member of a board or commission member shall become vacant if the member:

- 1. Ceases to meet the qualifications prescribed for the office;*
- 2. Resigns;*
- 3. Dies;*
- 4. Is judicially determined to be incompetent;*
- 5. Is convicted of a felony;*
- 6. Is removed from office for breach of the public trust; or*
- 7. During any 12-month period while in office:*
 - a. Is absent from three regular meetings without excuse;*
 - b. Is absent from:*
 - i. Six regular meetings; or*
 - ii. Eight regular meetings for members of the planning and zoning commission, urban design commission, platting board, or zoning board of examiners and appeals; or*
 - c. Fails to attend a two-thirds majority of the regular meetings without excuse."*

Audit Finding. From January 2020 through May 2021, the Commission did not meet. Although we were provided an agenda for a February 27, 2020, meeting, despite multiple requests we never received the meeting minutes and could not find a meeting announcement. Therefore, we could not confirm that the meeting occurred.

7. **Did the Commission meet regularly?**

AMC section 4.05.090, Meetings, states "A board or commission shall hold regular monthly meetings at such time and place as may from time to time be designated by the board or commission, but meetings need not be held if no business is pending. Boards and commissions shall advise the public of their meeting schedules, or publicly advertise their meetings where necessitated by statutory requirements. The chairman of a board or commission, or the municipal employee who is designated as an ex officio member of the board or commission pursuant to section 4.05.140, or a majority of the board or commission, may call a special meeting of the board or commission. Meetings of all boards and commissions shall be open to the public, except for an executive session, from which the public may be excluded."

Audit Finding. From January 2020 through May 2021, the Commission did not meet. Although we were provided an agenda for a February 27, 2020, meeting, we never received the meeting minutes and could not find a meeting announcement. Therefore, we could not confirm that the meeting occurred.

8. **Were minutes taken and published?**

AMC section 4.05.130, Reports, minutes and public hearing records, states "A board or commission shall keep minutes of the board or commission proceedings, and such minutes shall record the vote of each member physically present upon every question formally presented to the board or commissions for its consideration. The minutes shall be maintained in the custody of the municipal agency which supplies staff support to the board or commission and shall be a public record, open to inspection by any person."

Audit Finding. From January 2020 through May 2021, the Commission did not meet. Although we were provided an agenda for a February 27, 2020, meeting, we never received the meeting minutes and could not find a meeting announcement. Therefore, we could not confirm that the meeting occurred.

9. Did meetings have action items or other business?

AMC subsection 4.60.275B. states "The youth advisory commission shall have the following powers and duties:

- 1. Advise the mayor and assembly on issues, services and programs from the youth perspective in our community.*
- 2. Assist and advise the administration and assembly in developing plans for the establishment of programs and services where none now exist.*
- 3. Assist in coordinating youth services and programs.*
- 4. Assist and advise the mayor and assembly on existing services and programs for youth.*
- 5. Conduct educational and public relations programs designed to create public awareness of the needs of youth and the services which youth can provide to the community.*
- 6. Conduct surveys and compile and disseminate information concerning housing, health, nutrition, transportation, education, recreation, legal services, and social and mental health services available or not available to youth.*
- 7. At their own initiative, or in response from the mayor or assembly, make recommendations to the mayor and assembly regarding policies, practices and legislation from the youth perspective.*
- 8. The commission shall select three adult community members to serve as its advisory board. Members will be appointed by the youth commission, subject to approval by the mayor.*
- 9. There is established a Youth Representative to the Anchorage Assembly seat for one person. The commission shall nominate individual youths for appointment as the youth representative and an alternate to the Anchorage Assembly. Candidates for the position may shadow a current assembly member prior to nominations or appointment. The youth representative and an alternate shall be appointed for a certain term by the chair of the assembly and confirmed by the assembly. The alternate for the youth representative shall serve in the absence of the youth representative and have all the privileges of the position, but does not automatically assume the position if it becomes vacant."*

Audit Finding. From January 2020 through May 2021, the Commission had not provided any reports or resolutions to the Mayor's Office or the Assembly. In June 2020, the Assembly appropriated a \$1,500 grant to the Commission in collaboration with Alaska Mask Makers for the Spirit of Youth COVID-19 Youth Messaging Grant. As of May 2021, the Municipality of Anchorage's financial records showed that the funds had not been spent. According to Commission staff, "Alaska Mask Makers did expend funds, but never submitted an invoice despite multiple requests, so we never issued the payment." Finally, from January 2020 through May 2021, the Commission had not nominated a youth representative and an alternate youth representative to the Assembly.