

SUNSET AUDIT REPORT

2018-S7

Library Advisory Board

Anchorage Public Library

August 10, 2018

MUNICIPALITY OF ANCHORAGE
Internal Audit Department
632 W 6th Avenue, Suite 600
P.O. Box 196650
Anchorage, Alaska 99519-6650
www.muni.org/departments/internal_audit



INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT
Michael Chadwick, CIA, CICA
Director
Phone: (907) 343-4438
Fax: (907) 343-4370
E-Mail: chadwickmb@muni.org



Municipality of Anchorage

Ethan Berkowitz, Mayor

Internal Audit Department

August 10, 2018

Honorable Mayor and Members of the Assembly:

I am pleased to present **Sunset Audit Report 2018-S7, Library Advisory Board, Anchorage Public Library**, for your review. A brief summary of the report is presented below.

In accordance with Assembly Ordinance Number 2011-64(S-1), Section 14, we have performed a sunset audit of the Library Advisory Board. The objective of this audit was to provide information to the Mayor and Assembly to assist them in determining if the Library Advisory Board should be reauthorized. Our audit included a review of meeting minutes, resolutions and agendas, and member authorization and participation.

Based on our review of meeting minutes, resolutions, and attendance records, we recommend that the Library Advisory Board be reauthorized.

The Library Advisory Board will sunset on October 14, 2018, unless reauthorized by the Assembly.

Michael Chadwick, CIA, CICA
Director, Internal Audit



Municipality of Anchorage

Ethan Berkowitz, Mayor

Internal Audit Department

August 10, 2018

Sunset Audit Report 2018-S7
Library Advisory Board
Anchorage Public Library

Introduction. We have performed a sunset audit of the Library Advisory Board (Board) as required by Assembly Ordinance Number 2011-64(S-1), Section 14 which states:

“The Municipal Clerk shall notify the Assembly and the Mayor by assembly memorandum at least 120 days prior to the sunset of any board or commission, and an ordinance for reauthorization shall be introduced through the Assembly Chair with the assembly memorandum. The assembly memorandum shall include direction to the Office of Internal Audit to audit the board or commission under Anchorage Municipal Code section 3.20.110 D.3. and 4. The Office of Internal Audit shall report its findings to the Mayor and Assembly at least 60 days, prior to sunset, prior to vote by the Assembly on reauthorization.”

Objective and Scope. The objective of this audit was to provide information to the Mayor and Assembly to assist them in determining if the Board should be reauthorized. Our audit included a review of meeting minutes, resolutions and agendas, and member authorization and participation.

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards, except for the requirement of an external quality control review. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained

provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. The audit was performed during the period of May through July 2018.

Overall Evaluation. Based on our review of meeting minutes, resolutions, and attendance records, we recommend that the Board be reauthorized.

SUNSET FACTORS

The following factors were used in our evaluation and are presented for information to the Mayor and Assembly:

1. Name of Board.

Library Advisory Board

2. Sunset Date.

October 14, 2018

3. The purpose and goal of the Board.

Anchorage Municipal Code (AMC) subsection 4.60.040B., Library advisory board, states "The board shall:

- 1. Act as the planning body in charge of all library activities of the municipality, including but not limited to operation of principal and branch libraries now existing or hereafter established, mobile library services, special library projects such as radio and television projects, and any and all other library functions.*

2. *Make recommendations to the administration and assembly for the adoption, change, repeal or alteration of rules, regulations, restrictions on library services, and all other matters directly or indirectly affecting the municipal library program.*
3. *Perform such other powers and duties as the assembly may refer from time to time.*
4. *Review annually the library budget and its operations.”*

4. **Have Board members been appointed?**

AMC subsection 4.60.040A. states “There is established a library advisory board consisting of nine members.”

Audit Finding. Currently, the Board is fully staffed.

<u>Board Member</u>	<u>Most Recent Assembly Confirmation</u>	<u>Term Expiration Date</u>
David Levy	10-27-15	10-14-18
Guadalupe Marroquin	10-27-15	10-14-18
Barbara Jacobs	9-13-16	10-14-19
Lourdes Linato-Crawford	12-20-16	10-14-19
Jonathan Bittner	11-7-17	10-14-20
Cristy Willer	11-7-17	10-14-20
Viktoriya Chilcote	1-23-18	10-14-20
Nancy Hemsath	6-26-18	10-14-19
Jamie Lang	6-26-18	10-14-18

Source: Assembly Memorandums

5. Are the terms of the Board members current?

AMC section 4.05.040, Terms, states “Except as otherwise specified in this Code, the regular term of each member of a board or commission is three years commencing on October 15 of the year in which appointed and ending three years thereafter on October 14, provided however, to avoid a vacancy until new appointments can be made and confirmed, an appointed member's term is extended until a new appointment is confirmed or a maximum of 120 days which ever occurs first. The terms of initial or subsequent appointments to a board or commission shall be staggered so that, as nearly as possible, a pro rata number of its members shall be appointed each year of the established regular term of office.”

Audit Finding. The terms for all Board members are current.

6. Are positions deemed vacant after the maximum number of absences?

AMC subsection 4.05.060A., Attendance requirements; vacancies, states “. . . a vacancy shall occur if a member during any 12-month period while in office:

- 1. Is absent from three regular meetings without excuse;*
- 2. Is absent from:*
 - a. six regular meetings; or*
 - b. eight regular meetings for members of the planning and zoning commission, platting board, or zoning board of examiners and appeals; or*
- 3. Fails to attend a two-thirds majority of the regular meetings.”*

Note: Attendance requirements found in AMC subsection 4.05.060A. were amended on April 24, 2018, by Assembly Ordinance Number 2018-31, as amended. According to Assembly Counsel, this ordinance is effective prospectively. As a result, the amended changes did not affect this sunset audit for the period beginning January 2017 and ending May 2018. AMC subsection 4.05.060A. cited above is the language prior to the April 24, 2018, amendment.

Audit Finding. No members were absent from three regular meetings without an excuse within any 12-month period from January 2017 through May 2018.

One member was absent from six regular meetings in every 12-month period and also failed to attend two-thirds of the regular meetings in every 12-month period from January 2017 through May 2018. This member has not been removed from the Board.

Another member failed to attend two-thirds of the regular meetings in every 12-month period from January 2017 through May 2018. This member has not been removed from the Board.

7. **Does the Board meet regularly?**

AMC section 4.05.090, Meetings, states “A board or commission shall hold regular monthly meetings at such time and place as may from time to time be designated by the board or commission, but meetings need not be held if no business is pending. Boards and commissions shall advise the public of their meeting schedules, or publicly advertise their meetings where necessitated by statutory requirements. The chairman of a board or commission, or the municipal employee who is designated as an ex officio member of the board or commission pursuant to section 4.05.140, or a majority of the board or commission, may call a special meeting of the board or commission. Meetings of all boards and commissions shall be open to the public, except for an executive session, from which the public may be excluded.”

Audit Finding. From January 2017 through May 2018, the Board met 13 times. Meetings are publicly announced on the Board’s website.

8. **Are minutes taken and published?**

AMC section 4.05.130, Reports, minutes and public hearing records, states “A board or commission shall keep minutes of the board or commission proceedings, and such minutes

shall record the vote of each member physically present upon every question formally presented to the board or commissions for its consideration. The minutes shall be maintained in the custody of the municipal agency which supplies staff support to the board or commission and shall be a public record, open to inspection by any person. ”

Audit Finding. Meeting minutes were taken at each Board meeting. Anchorage Public Library (Library) staff keeps a copy available for the public. In addition, the meeting minutes are available on the Board’s website.

9. **Do meetings have action items or other business?**

AMC subsection 4.60.040B. states “The board shall:

- 1. Act as the planning body in charge of all library activities of the municipality, including but not limited to operation of principal and branch libraries now existing or hereafter established, mobile library services, special library projects such as radio and television projects, and any and all other library functions.*
- 2. Make recommendations to the administration and assembly for the adoption, change, repeal or alteration of rules, regulations, restrictions on library services, and all other matters directly or indirectly affecting the municipal library program.*
- 3. Perform such other powers and duties as the assembly may refer from time to time.*
- 4. Review annually the library budget and its operations.”*

Audit Finding. The Board has not provided any reports or resolutions to the Mayor’s Office or the Assembly from January 2017 through June 2018. However, Board minutes included action items that the Board voted on, such as the Library’s Computer Use and Internet Policy, Code of Conduct, and Circulation Policy. Board minutes also included discussion items like the Library’s strategic plan, a downtown Library branch, a flood in the Library’s Alaska room, and the Library renovation. The Board also received reports from groups and individuals, such as the Alaska Library Association and the Library Director.