

SUNSET AUDIT REPORT

2018-S3

Senior Citizens Advisory Commission

Department of Health and Human Services

August 10, 2018

MUNICIPALITY OF ANCHORAGE
Internal Audit Department
632 W 6th Avenue, Suite 600
P.O. Box 196650
Anchorage, Alaska 99519-6650
www.muni.org/departments/internal_audit



INTERNAL AUDIT DEPARTMENT
Michael Chadwick, CIA, CICA
Director
Phone: (907) 343-4438
Fax: (907) 343-4370
E-Mail: chadwickmb@muni.org



Municipality of Anchorage

Ethan Berkowitz, Mayor

Internal Audit Department

August 10, 2018

Honorable Mayor and Members of the Assembly:

I am pleased to present **Sunset Audit Report 2018-S3, Senior Citizens Advisory Commission, Department of Health and Human Services**, for your review. A brief summary of the report is presented below.

In accordance with Assembly Ordinance Number 2011-64(S-1), Section 14, we have performed a sunset audit of the Senior Citizens Advisory Commission. The objective of this audit was to provide information to the Mayor and Assembly to assist them in determining if the Senior Citizens Advisory Commission should be reauthorized. Our audit included a review of meeting minutes, resolutions and agendas, and member authorization and participation.

Based on our review of meeting minutes, resolutions, and attendance records, we recommend that the Senior Citizens Advisory Commission be reauthorized.

The Senior Citizens Advisory Commission will sunset on October 14, 2018, unless reauthorized by the Assembly.

Michael Chadwick, CIA, CICA
Director, Internal Audit



Municipality of Anchorage

Ethan Berkowitz, Mayor

Internal Audit Department

August 10, 2018

Sunset Audit Report 2018-S3
Senior Citizens Advisory Commission
Department of Health and Human Services

Introduction. We have performed a sunset audit of the Senior Citizens Advisory Commission (Commission) as required by Assembly Ordinance Number 2011-64(S-1), Section 14 which states:

“The Municipal Clerk shall notify the Assembly and the Mayor by assembly memorandum at least 120 days prior to the sunset of any board or commission, and an ordinance for reauthorization shall be introduced through the Assembly Chair with the assembly memorandum. The assembly memorandum shall include direction to the Office of Internal Audit to audit the board or commission under Anchorage Municipal Code section 3.20.110 D.3. and 4. The Office of Internal Audit shall report its findings to the Mayor and Assembly at least 60 days, prior to sunset, prior to vote by the Assembly on reauthorization.”

Objective and Scope. The objective of this audit was to provide information to the Mayor and Assembly to assist them in determining if the Commission should be reauthorized. Our audit included a review of meeting minutes, resolutions and agendas, and member authorization and participation.

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards, except for the requirement of an external quality control review. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. The audit was performed during the period of May through July 2018.

Overall Evaluation. Based on our review of meeting minutes, resolutions, and attendance records, we recommend that the Commission be reauthorized.

SUNSET FACTORS

The following factors were used in our evaluation and are presented for information to the Mayor and Assembly:

1. **Name of Commission.**

Senior Citizens Advisory Commission

2. **Sunset Date.**

October 14, 2018

3. **The purpose and goal of the Commission.**

Anchorage Municipal Code (AMC) subsection 4.60.110A., Senior citizens advisory commission, states “. . . The commission shall be empowered to:

- 1. Advise the mayor, the assembly and appropriate department heads with respect to aspects of aging which bear upon the welfare of senior citizens.*
- 2. Conduct surveys and compile and disseminate for the benefit of senior citizens information on housing, health, nutrition, transportation, education, recreation, legal services and social and mental health services.*
- 3. Carry out educational and public relations programs designed to create public awareness of the needs of senior citizens and the community services which senior citizens can provide.*

4. *Assist and provide programs that alert elderly persons of the resources and services available to them.”*

4. **Have Commission members been appointed?**

AMC subsection 4.60.110A. states “There is established a senior citizens advisory commission consisting of nine members, each of whom shall serve for a three-year term.”

Audit Finding. Currently, the Commission is fully staffed.

<u>Commission Member</u>	<u>Most Recent Assembly Confirmation</u>	<u>Term Expiration Date</u>
Theresa Brisky	11-10-15	10-14-18
Gayle Schuh	11-10-15	10-14-18
Hattie Gardner	5-10-16	10-14-18
AnnaBell Stevens	1-24-17	10-14-19
Kevin Turkington	1-24-17	10-14-19
Emily McMahan	2-27-18	10-14-19
Dawnia Clements	2-27-18	10-14-20
James Bailey	2-27-18	10-14-20
Jenna Bruner	2-27-18	10-14-20

Source: Assembly Memorandums

5. **Are the terms of the Commission members current?**

AMC section 4.05.040, Terms, states “Except as otherwise specified in this Code, the regular term of each member of a board or commission is three years commencing on October 15 of

the year in which appointed and ending three years thereafter on October 14, provided however, to avoid a vacancy until new appointments can be made and confirmed, an appointed member's term is extended until a new appointment is confirmed or a maximum of 120 days which ever occurs first. The terms of initial or subsequent appointments to a board or commission shall be staggered so that, as nearly as possible, a pro rata number of its members shall be appointed each year of the established regular term of office."

Audit Finding. The terms for all Commission members are current.

6. Are positions deemed vacant after the maximum number of absences?

AMC subsection 4.05.060A., Attendance requirements; vacancies, states ". . . a vacancy shall occur if a member during any 12-month period while in office:

- 1. Is absent from three regular meetings without excuse;*
- 2. Is absent from:*
 - a. six regular meetings; or*
 - b. eight regular meetings for members of the planning and zoning commission, platting board, or zoning board of examiners and appeals; or*
- 3. Fails to attend a two-thirds majority of the regular meetings."*

Note: Attendance requirements found in AMC subsection 4.05.060A. were amended on April 24, 2018, by Assembly Ordinance Number 2018-31, as amended. According to Assembly Counsel, this ordinance is effective prospectively. As a result, the amended changes did not affect this sunset audit for the period beginning January 2017 and ending May 2018. AMC subsection 4.05.060A. cited above is the language prior to the April 24, 2018, amendment.

Audit Finding. One member was absent from three regular meetings without an excuse in the 12-month periods from January 2017 through December 2017 and from June 2017 through May 2018. This member also failed to attend two-thirds of the regular meetings in the 12-month period from January 2017 through December 2017. This member has not been removed from the Commission.

No members were absent from six regular meetings within any 12-month period from January 2017 through May 2018.

Another member failed to attend two-thirds of the regular meetings in the 12-month period from January 2017 through December 2017. This member has not been removed from the Commission.

7. **Does the Commission meet regularly?**

AMC section 4.05.090, Meetings, states "A board or commission shall hold regular monthly meetings at such time and place as may from time to time be designated by the board or commission, but meetings need not be held if no business is pending. Boards and commissions shall advise the public of their meeting schedules, or publicly advertise their meetings where necessitated by statutory requirements. The chairman of a board or commission, or the municipal employee who is designated as an ex officio member of the board or commission pursuant to section 4.05.140, or a majority of the board or commission, may call a special meeting of the board or commission. Meetings of all boards and commissions shall be open to the public, except for an executive session, from which the public may be excluded."

Audit Finding. From January 2017 through May 2018, the Commission met 17 times. Meetings are publicly announced on the Commission's website and on the Municipality of Anchorage's Public Notices website.

8. **Are minutes taken and published?**

AMC section 4.05.130, Reports, minutes and public hearing records, states "A board or commission shall keep minutes of the board or commission proceedings, and such minutes shall record the vote of each member physically present upon every question formally presented to the board or commissions for its consideration. The minutes shall be maintained

in the custody of the municipal agency which supplies staff support to the board or commission and shall be a public record, open to inspection by any person.”

Audit Finding. Meeting minutes were taken at each Commission meeting. Department of Health and Human Services’ staff keeps a copy available for the public. In addition, the meeting minutes are available on the Department of Health and Human Services’ website.

9. Do meetings have action items or other business?

AMC subsection 4.60.110A. states “. . . The commission shall be empowered to:

- 1. Advise the mayor, the assembly and appropriate department heads with respect to aspects of aging which bear upon the welfare of senior citizens.*
- 2. Conduct surveys and compile and disseminate for the benefit of senior citizens information on housing, health, nutrition, transportation, education, recreation, legal services and social and mental health services.*
- 3. Carry out educational and public relations programs designed to create public awareness of the needs of senior citizens and the community services which senior citizens can provide.*
- 4. Assist and provide programs that alert elderly persons of the resources and services available to them.”*

Audit Finding. From January 2017 through May 2018, the Commission issued one joint resolution with the Municipal Health and Human Services Commission honoring the life and work of a former commissioner. In addition, the Commission provide a letter to the Mayor and Assembly updating them on the work the Commission accomplished. The letter referred to topics such as an Aging in Place survey and a joint meeting with the Mat-Su Council on Aging. Moreover, other letters offered support for AnchorRIDES and for the State Health Insurance Counseling and Assistance Program. The Commission also awarded the annual Ron Hammett

Award to recognize “. . . individuals whose outstanding service, dedication and leadership has had a significant impact on the quality of life for seniors in the Municipality of Anchorage.” This award was presented at the annual Older Americans Month Kick Off Event. Finally, Commission meetings often included presentations from organizations such as the Chugiak-Eagle River Senior Center, the Salvation Army, and the Cook Inlet Housing Authority.